UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT DISTRICT OF RHODE ISLAND

ALBERT L. GRAY, ADMINISTRATOR,)	
ET AL.,)	
Pla	aintiff) C.A. 1	No. 04-312/L
)	
v.)	
)	
JEFFREY DERDERIAN, ET AL.,)	
De	efendant)	

DEFENDANT MCLAUGHLIN & MORAN, INC.'S ANSWER TO PLAINTIFFS' FIRST AMENDED MASTER COMPLAINT

The defendant McLaughlin & Moran, Inc. ("McLaughlin & Moran") responds to the allegations of plaintiffs' complaint as follows:

FIRST DEFENSE

- 1. Answering the allegations of the paragraph captioned "Introduction," Defendant McLaughlin & Moran states that it is prefatory language for which no response is required. To the extent that a response is required, McLaughlin & Moran lacks knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph.
- 2. Defendant McLaughlin & Moran lacks sufficient knowledge or information to form a belief as to the truth of paragraphs 1-240 and 271.
- 3. Answering the allegations of paragraphs 272-279; 284-286; 291-293; 298-299; 304-307; 312-315; 320-323; 328-331; 335-339; 344-347; 352-355; 360-363; 368-371; 376-384; 395-402; 405-408; 411-425; 434-436; 441-444; 447-450; 453-456; 459-464; 652-659; 666-675; 680-683; 688-691; Count I (¶¶ 280-81); Count II (¶¶ 282-283); Count III (¶¶ 287-288) Count IV (¶¶ 289-290); Count V (¶¶ 294-295); Count

VI (¶¶ 296-297); Count VII (¶¶ 300-301); Count VIII (¶¶ 302-303); Count IX (¶¶ 308-309); Count X (¶¶ 310-311); Count XI (¶¶ 316-317); Count XII (¶¶ 318-319); Count XIII (¶¶ 324-325); Count XIV (¶¶ 326-327); Count XV (¶¶ 332-333); Count XVI (¶ 334); Count XVII (¶¶ 340-41); Count XVIII (¶¶ 342-343); Count XIX (¶¶ 348-349); Count XX (¶¶ 350-351); Count XXI (¶¶ 356-357); Count XXII (¶¶ 358-359); Count XXIII (¶¶ 364-365); Count XXI (¶¶ 366-367); Count XXV (¶¶ 372-373); Count XXVI (¶¶ 374-375); Count XXVII (¶¶ 385-386); Count XXIX (¶¶403-404); Count XXX (¶¶ 409-410); Count XXXI (¶¶ 426-427); Count XXXII (¶¶ 428-429); Count XXXIII (¶¶ 430-431); Count XXXIV (¶¶ 432-433); Count XXXV (¶¶ 437-438); Count XXXVI (¶¶ 439-440); Count XXXVII (¶¶ 445-446); Count XXXVIII (¶¶ 451-452); Count XXXIX (¶¶ 457-458); Count XL (¶¶ 465-466); Count XLI (¶¶ 467-468); Count XLII (¶¶ 469-472); Count XLIII (¶¶ 473-477); Count XLIV (¶¶ 478-480); Count XLV (¶¶ 481-484); Count XLVI (¶¶ 485-489); Count XLVII (¶¶ 490-492); Count XLVIII (¶¶ 493-498); Count XLIX (¶¶ 499-503); Count L (¶¶ 504-506); Count LI (¶¶ 507-511); Count LII (¶¶ 512-532); Count LIII (¶¶ 533-535); Count LIV (¶¶ 536-539); Count LX (¶¶ 540-560); Count LVI (¶¶ 561-563); Count LVII (¶ 564-567); Count LVIII (¶ 568-588); Count LIX (¶ 589-591); Count LX (¶¶ 592-596); Count LXI (¶¶ 597-617); Count LXII (¶¶ 618-620); LXIII (¶¶ 621-622); Count LXIV (¶ 623-625); Count LXV (¶ 626-628); Count LXVI (¶ 629-631); Count LXVII (¶ 632-634); Count LXVIII (¶ 635-643); and Count LXIX (¶¶ 644-648); Count LXX (\P 649-651); Count LXXI (\P 660-661); Count LXXII (\P 662-663); Count LXXIII (¶¶664-665); Count LXXIV (¶¶676-677); Count LXXV (¶¶ 678-679); Count LXXVI (¶¶ 684-685); Count LXXVII (¶¶ 686-687); Count LXXVIII (¶¶ 692-693); Count LXXIX (¶¶ 694-695); Count LXXX (¶696-701); Count LXXXI (¶¶ 702-706),

avers that these paragraphs refer to defendants other than McLaughlin & Moran for which no answer or response is required of this defendant. To the extent an answer is required, McLaughlin & Moran lacks knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations of those paragraphs. To the extent any of these paragraphs incorporate other paragraphs to which McLaughlin & Moran has separately or specifically replied, McLaughlin & Moran incorporates its responses to those paragraphs herein.

- 4. Answering the allegations of paragraph 387, Defendant McLaughlin & Moran admits it is a Rhode Island corporation with a principal place of business in Cranston, County of Providence, Rhode Island and at all relevant times McLaughlin & Moran was the wholesaler for Anheuser-Busch products in Rhode Island, avers that the remaining allegations of this paragraph are legal conclusions for which no response is required and states further that if an answer is deemed required, McLaughlin & Moran denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.
- 5. Answering the allegations of paragraph 388, McLaughlin & Moran admits that it advertised and conducted a beer promotion concurrently with The Station's presentation of Great White on February 20, 2003 and denies any and all remaining allegations of this paragraph.
- 6. Defendant McLaughlin & Moran denies the allegations of paragraphs 389-392.
- 7. Answering the allegations of paragraph 393, Defendant McLaughlin & Moran repeats and realleges its responses to paragraphs 1 through 392 as if set forth fully herein.

8. Answering the allegations of paragraph 394, Defendant McLaughlin & Moran states that it sets forth conclusions of law for which no response is required. To the extent that a response is required, defendant McLaughlin & Moran denies the allegations of this paragraph.

SECOND DEFENSE

Plaintiffs have failed to state a claim upon which relief may be granted against defendant McLaughlin & Moran.

THIRD DEFENSE

Defendant McLaughlin & Moran owed no legal duty to the Plaintiffs.

FOURTH DEFENSE

Plaintiffs' purported injuries were directly and/or proximately caused in whole or in part by the negligent, criminal or otherwise improper conduct of other third parties over whom McLaughlin & Moran exercised no control and for whom McLaughlin & Moran is not legally responsible.

FIFTH DEFENSE

If McLaughlin & Moran is found liable to Plaintiffs, then it is entitled to a set-off for all settlements/benefits received by Plaintiffs.

SIXTH DEFENSE

The injuries or damages purportedly sustained by Plaintiffs are the result of intervening and/or supervening acts of a person or entity over whom McLaughlin & Moran exercised no control and for whom McLaughlin & Moran is not legally responsible.

SEVENTH DEFENSE

Under the laws applicable to this case and to the extent claimed by Plaintiffs, no

punitive damages can be recovered by Plaintiffs as punitive damages are appropriate only when there is proof that the acts complained of were done with malice and bad faith, and with the intent to cause harm.

EIGHTH DEFENSE

To the extent that Plaintiffs seek to impose punitive damages, any such claim for punitive damages would be unconstitutional under the United States Constitution and applicable provisions of the Rhode Island State Constitution and unlawful under applicable State statutes to the extent that, among other things: (1) McLaughlin & Moran's liability for punitive damages and the appropriate amount of punitive damages are not required to be established by clear and convincing evidence; (2) punitive damages are sought to be awarded without bifurcating the trial of all punitive damages issues; (3) any award of punitive damages is sought with no predetermined limit, such as maximum multiple of compensatory damages or a maximum amount on the amount of punitive damages that the court or a jury may impose; (4) any award of punitive damages is based on anything other than McLaughlin & Moran's alleged conduct in connection with the transaction at issue in this lawsuit; or (5) an award of punitive damages is sought for the purpose of compensating Plaintiffs for elements of damages not otherwise recognizable by applicable state law.

NINTH DEFENSE

To the extent Plaintiffs seek to impose punitive or exemplary damages, Plaintiffs' claims for punitive or exemplary damages are barred or reduced by applicable law or statute or, in the alternative, are unconstitutional insofar as they violate the due process protections afforded by the United States Constitution, the excessive fines clause of the Eighth Amendment of the United States Constitution, the Commerce Clause of the United states Constitution, the Full Faith

Credit Clause of the United States Constitution, and applicable provisions of the Constitution of the State of Rhode Island. Any law, statute or other authority purporting to permit the recovery of punitive damages in this case is unconstitutional, facially and as applied, to the extent that, without limitation, it: (1) lacks constitutionally sufficient standards to guide the discretion used in determining whether to award punitive damages; (2) is void for vagueness in that it fails to provide adequate advance notice as to what conduct will result in punitive damages; (3) unconstitutionally may permit recovery of punitive damages in any amount that is not both reasonable and proportionate to the amount of harm, if any to Plaintiffs and to the amount of compensatory damages, if any; (4) unconstitutionally may permit consideration of net worth or other financial information; (5) does not expressly prohibit awarding punitive damages, or determining the amount of an award of punitive damages, in whole or in part, on the basis of individually discriminatory characteristics, including the corporate status of McLaughlin & Moran; (6) lacks constitutionally sufficient standards to be applied by the trial court in postverdict review of any punitive damages award; (7) lacks constitutionally sufficient standards for appellate review of any punitive damages award; and (8) otherwise fails to satisfy Supreme Court precedent.

WHEREFORE, the defendant McLaughlin & Moran, Inc. respectfully requests that:

A. the Plaintiffs Complaint be dismissed with prejudice as to it;

- B. Plaintiffs' demands for relief against it be denied in every respect; and
- C. the Court grant such other and further relief as may be just, proper and equitable.

Howard A. Merten, #3171
Eric M. Sommers, #6213
VETTER & WHITE
Attorneys for Defendant
McLaughlin & Moran, Inc.

20 Washington Place

Providence, Rhode Island 02903 (401) 421-3060 (401) 272-6803 FAX

Dated: February , 2005

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

To:

Stephanie DiMaio Larivee, Esq. 215 Broadway Providence, RI 02903 singinglawyer@msn.com

Marc Reynolds, Esq.
Anthony F. DeMarco, Esq.
Reynolds, DeMarco & Boland, Ltd.
170 Westminster Street, Suite 200
Providence, RI 02903
tdemarco@conversent.net

James H. Reilly, III, Esq.
Donald J. Maroney, Esq.
Kelly, Kelleher, Reilly & Simpson
146 Westminster Street
Providence, RI 02903
jreilly@kkrs.com
dmaroney@kkrs.com

Ronald J. Resmini, Esq.
Ronald J. Creamer, Esq.
RONALD J. RESMINI LAW OFFICES
155 South Main Street
Providence, RI 02903
Resminilaw@yahoo.com

Robert I. Reardon, Jr., Esq.
Robert I Rimmer, Esq.
THE REARDON LAW FIRM, P.C.
160 Hempstead Street
New London, CT 06320
reardonlaw@aol.com

Christopher C. Fallon, Jr., Esq. COZEN O'CONNOR 1900 Market Street Philadelphia, PA 19103-3508 cfallon@cozen.com

Edward T. Hinchey, Esq.
Curtis R. Diedrich, Esq.
SLOANE & WALSH
Three Center Plaza
Boston, MA 02108
EHinchey@sloanwalsh.com
Cdiedrich@sloanewalsh.com

Thomas C. Angelone, Esq. One Turks Head Place Providence, RI 02903 Angelonelaw@aol.com

C. Russell Bengston, Esq. Carroll, Kelly & Murphy One Turks Head Place, Suite 400 Providence, RI 02903 rbengtson@ckmlaw.com Mark C. Hadden, Esq. 68 Kennedy Plaza Providence, RI 02903 mhadden@haddenlaw.com

Michael R. DeLuca, Esq. Gidley, Sarlie & Marusak, LLP One Turks Head Place, Suite 900 Providence, RI 02903 mrd@gsm-law.com Ralph J. Monaco, Esq.
Conway & Londregan
38 Huntington Street
P.O. Box 1351
New London, CT 06320
rmonaco.c-l@snet.net
Mark K. Ostrowski, Esq.
Jose M. Rojas, Esq.
Shipman & Goodwin, LLP
One American Row
Hartford, CT 06103-2819
mostrowski.@goodwin.com

John J. Nazzaro, Esq.
Law Offices of John J. Nazzaro, LLC
164 Hempstead Street
New London, CT 06320
nazzjn@aol.com

William A. Filippo, Esq. Steven A. Minicucci, Esq. Calvino Law Associates 373 Elmwood Avenue Providence, RI 02907 sminicucci@calvinolaw.com wfilippo@calvinolaw.com

Mark P. Dolan, Esq.
Anthony R. Leone, Esq.
Rice Dolan & Kershaw
170 Westminster Street, Suite 900
Providence, RI 02903
ricedolank@aol.com

Daniel J. Horgan, Esq. The Horgan Law Offices Shaw's Cove 5, Suite 200 New London, CT 06320 horganlaw@snet.net

Matthew Medeiros, Esq.
Little, Bulman, Medeiros & Whitney, P.C.
& Whitney, P.C.
72 Pine Street, 5th Floor
Providence, RI 02903
mfm@lmkbw.com

Stephen M. Prignano, Esq. Stephen J. MacGillivray, Esq. EDWARDS & ANGELL 2800 Financial Plaza

W. Thomas McGough, Jr., Esq. James J. Restivo, Esq. REED SMITH LLP 435 Sixth Avenue

Pittsburgh, PA 15219 tmcgough@ReedSmith.com

Marc DeSisto, Esq.
DESISTO LAW
211 Angell Street, P.O. Box 2563
Providence, RI 02906-2563
Marc@desistolaw.com

Scott J. Tucker, Esq.
Tucker Heifetz & Saltzman, LLP
Three School Street
Boston, MA 02108
stucker@ths-law.com

Patrick T. Jones, Esq. Cooley Manion Jones LLP 21 Custom House Street Boston, MA 02110 pjones@cmj-law.com

Joseph V. Cavanagh, Jr., Esq. Kristin E. Rodgers, Esq. Blish & Cavanagh, LLP 30 Exchange Terrace Providence, RI 02903 jvc@blishcavlaw.com

Faith LaSalle, Esq.
Law Offices of Faith LaSalle
One Turks Head Place
76 Westminster Street, Suite 1010
Providence, RI 02903
flasalle@lasallelaw.com

Providence, RI 02903 sprignano@edwardsangell.com

Andrew J. Trevelise, Esq. REED SMITH LLP 2500 One Liberty Place Philadelphia, PA 19103-7301 atrevelise@reedsmith.com

James T. Murphy, Esq. Kelly N. Michels, Esq. HANSON CURRAN LLP 146 Westminster Street Providence, RI 02903-2218 Jm@hansoncurran.com

Jessica Margolis, Esq. Debevoise & Plimpton 919 Third Avenue New York, NY 10022 jmargolis@debevoise.com

Carl A. Henlein, Esq.
John R. Crocket, III, Esq.
Susan S. Wettle, Esq.
FROST BROWN TODD
400 West Market Street, 32d Floor
Louisville, KY 40202-3363
chenlein@fbtlaw.com
jcrockett@fbtlaw.com
swettle@fbtlaw.com

Deborah G. Solmor, Esq.
Edward M. Crane, Esq.
Skadden, Arps, Slate, Meagher & Flom
333 West Wacker Drive, Suite 2
Chicago, IL 60606
DSOLMOR@skadden.com
ecrane@skadden.com

Randall Souza, Esq.
Fred Kelly, Jr., Esq.
Ian C. Ridlon, Esq.
NIXON PEABODY LLP
One Citizens Plaza, Suite 700
Providence, RI 02903
RSouza@nixonpeabody.com
fkelly@nixonpeabody.com

Brian R. Cunha, Esq. Brian Cunha, & Associates 904 Broadway East Providence, RI 02914 brian@briancunha.com

Howard J. Julian, <u>Pro Se</u> 570 Shermantown Road North Kingstown, RI 02874 <u>sohohomes@yahoo.com</u>

Eric Bradford Hermanson, Esq. Mark D. Cahill, Esq. Choate, Hall & Stewart Exchange Place, 53 State Street Boston, MA 02109 mcahill@choate.com

Mark S. Mandell, Esq.
Mandell, Schwartz & Boisclair
One Park Row
Providence, RI 02903
msmandell@msb.com

Stephen E. Breggia, Esq. Law Offices of Stephen Edward Breggia 395 Smith Street Providence, RI 02908 sbreggia@bbglaw.us James Lee, Esq.
Chief, Civil Division
Department of Attorney General
150 South Main Street
Providence, RI 02903
jlee@riag.state.ri.us

Edwin F. McPherson, Esq. McPherson & Kalmansohn 1801 Century Park East, 24th Floor Los Angeles, CA 90067 eMCPHERSON@M-KLAW.COM

Earl H. Walker, Esq.
Charles L. Babcock, Esq.
Nancy W. Hamilton, Esq.
Jackson Walker L.L. P.
1401 McKinney Street, Ste. 1900
Houston, TX 77010
cbabcock@jw.com

Ann M. Songer, Esq. Shook, Hardy & Bacon, LLP One Kansas City Place 1200 Main Street Kansas City, MO 64105-2118 asonger@shb.com

Max Wistow, Esq.
Wistow & Barylick Incorporated
61 Weybosset Street
Providence, RI 02903
mw@wistbar.com

Eva Marie Mancuso
Hamel, Waxler, Allen & Collins
387 Atwells Avenue
Providence, RI 02909
emancuso@hwac.com

Mark T. Nugent, Esq.
Paul V. Sullivan, Esq.
Morrison, Mahoney & Miller
One Providence Washington Plaza
Providence, RI 02903
mnugent@morrisonmahoney.com
pvsullivan@morrisonmahoney.com

Gregory L. Boyer, Esq.
Boyer, Reynolds & DeMarco, LTD
170 Westminster Street, Suite 200
Providence, RI 02903
boyerlaw1@aol.com

Ronald Langlois, Esq.
Lauren Wilkins, Esq.
Smith & Brink, P.C.
One State Street
Providence, RI 02908
Rlanglois@smithbrink.com

Donna M. Lamontagne, Esq. Zizik, Powers, O'Connell, Spaulding & Lamontagne, P.C. 40 Westminster Street Providence, RI 02903 Dlamontagne@zizikpowers.com

Charles N. Redihan, Jr., Esq. 91 Friendship Street
Providence, RI 02903
credihan@kprlaw.com

Richard. W. MacAdams, Esq. MacAdams & Wieck Incorporated 101 Dyer Street, Suite 400 Providence, RI 02903 rmacadams@mandwlaw.com

George E. Wolf III, Esq. Shook, Hardy & Bacon, LLP One Kansas City Place 1200 Main Street Kansas City, MO 64105-2118 gwolf@shb.com Michael A. St. Pierre, Esq. Revens, Revens & St. Pierre, P.C. 946 Centerville Road Warwick, RI 02886 mikesp@rrsplaw.com

Stephen Born, Esq. Law Offices of Donald E. Green, P.C. 2235 Washington Street Roxbury, MA 02119

Joseph F. Krowski, Esq. Law Offices of Joseph F. Krowski 30 Cottage Street Brockton, MA 02301

Bruce P. Keller, Esq.
Debevoise & Plimpton
919 Third Avenue
New York, NY 10022
bpkeller@debevoise.com

Thomas W. Lyons, Esq.
Strauss, Factor & Lopes
222 Richmond Street, Suite 208
Providence, RI 02903-2914
tlyons@straussfactor.com

Stephen B. Lang, Esq. Higgins, Cavanagh & Cooney 123 Dyer Street Providence, RI 02903 slang@hcc-law.com I hereby certify that I served on the above-named counsel of record a copy of the within Answer of Defendant McLaughlin & Moran, Inc. by electronic mail and on Stephen Born, Esq. and Joseph F. Krowski, Esq. by first-class mail postage prepaid on the 4th day of February, 2005.

12